

Comparison of Tool Items with Nonverbal Pain Indicators Identified in the AGS 2002 Persistent Pain Guidelines

AGS Guideline	Abbey Scale* (Abbey et al., 2004)	ADD (Kovach et al., 1999)	CNPI (Feldt, 2000)	DS-DAT (Hurley et al, 1992)	Doloplus 2 (The Doloplus Group, 2001)
Facial expressions Slight frown; sad, frightened face Grimacing, wrinkled forehead, closed or tightened eyes Any distorted expression Rapid blinking	Frowning, grimacing, looking frightened, looking tense	Sad or frightened facial expression	Facial grimacing or wincing, (clenched teeth, furrowed brow, tightened lips, narrowed eyes)	Frown Sad facial expression Frightened facial expression Content of facial expression	Expression <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Showing pain • Unusually blank look (voiceless, staring, blank looks)
Verbalizations, vocalizations Sighing, moaning, groaning Grunting, chanting, calling out Noisy breathing Asking for help Verbally abusive	Whimpering, groaning,	Intense repetitive verbalization Verbal outburst toward another person Noisy breathing	Vocal complaints: (That hurts, Ouch, Stop) Nonverbal vocalization: (Sighs, Gasps, Moans, Cries)	Negative vocalization Noisy breathing	Somatic complaints: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • expressed upon enquiry only • Occasional involuntary • Continuous involuntary
Body movements Rigid, tense body posture, guarding Fidgeting Increased pacing, rocking Restricted movement Gait or mobility changes	Guarding part of body Fidgeting, Rocking	Tense body language Fidgeting Tense repetitive movement During transfers: grimace, brace himself, groan	Massaging the affected area Restlessness: (Shifting, Rocking, Inability to sit still) Bracing behavior: (Clutching or holding affected area during movement)	Tense body language Fidgeting Relaxed body language	Somatic reactions Protective body postures at rest: -Avoiding certain positions -Protective postures -Protection of sore areas: Mobility: Usual activities reduced Resistive to movement
Changes in Interpersonal Interactions Aggressive, combative, resisting care, Decreased social interactions Socially inappropriate, disruptive Withdrawn	Withdrawn	Physical aggression Withdrawn behavior			Communication: -Heightened, demanding attention, Lessened, Absence/ refusal of any form of communication Social life - -Participation in activities: normally, only when asked to do so, Sometimes refuses, Refuses to participate in anything Behavioral problems
Changes in activity patterns or routines Refusing food, appetite change Increase in rest periods Sleep, rest pattern changes Sudden cessation of common routines; Increased wandering	Alteration in usual patterns Refusing to eat	Wandering requiring intervention Repetitive waking during the night			Psychomotor reactions - Changes in ability to wash and/or dress Somatic reactions -Sleep pattern changes with waking and restlessness or insomnia
Mental status changes Crying or tears Increased confusion Irritability or distress	Increased confusion Crying	Tearfulness Delusions Phobias or fears Hallucinations			

Comparison of Tool Items with Nonverbal Pain Indicators Identified in the AGS 2002 Persistent Pain Guidelines

AGS Guideline	FLACC* (Merkel et al., 1997)	NOPPAIN* (Snow et al., 2003)	PADE (Villanueva et al, 2003)	PAINAD* (Warden et al, 2003)	PACSLAC (Fuchs-Lachelle et al., 2004)
Facial expressions Slight frown; sad, frightened face Grimacing, wrinkled forehead, closed or tightened eyes Any distorted expression Rapid blinking	No particular expression or smile Occasional grimace or frown Withdrawn Disinterested	Pain faces? (Grimaces, Furrowed brow, Winces)	Frowning Sad facial expression Anxious/frightened facial expression	Facial expression	Facial Expressions: Grimacing, Sad look, Tighter face, Dirty look Change in eyes, Frowning, Pain expression, Grim face Clenching teeth, Wincing Opening mouth, Crasing forehead, Screwing up nose
Verbalizations, vocalizations Sighing, moaning, groaning Grunting, chanting, calling out Noisy breathing Asking for help Verbally abusive	Cry: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No cry (awake or asleep) • Moans or whimpers • Occasional complaint Frequent to constant quivering chin Crying steadily, screams or sobs, frequent complaints	Pain words? (“That hurts!”, “Ouch!” “Stop that!”, Cursing) Pain Noises? (Moans, Groans, Grunts, Cries, Gasps, Sighs)	Moaning/groaning, Breathing rapidly or hyperventilating Breathing sounds loud, gasping, etc? Speech or other vocalizations sound distressed	Negative vocalization Breathing	Screaming/Yelling, Calling out (i.e. for help), A specific sound or vocalization for pain “ou”, ouch, Moaning and groaning, Mumbling, Grunting, Verbal aggression
Body movements Rigid, tense body posture, Guarding, Fidgeting Increased pacing, rocking Restricted movement Gait or mobility changes	Legs: Normal position or relaxed Uneasy, restless, tense Kicking, legs drawn up Activity: Lying, quietly, normal position, moves easily Squirming, shifting back and forth, Tense Arched, rigid or jerking	Rubbing? (Massaging affected area) Restlessness? (Frequent shifting Rocking, Inability to stay still)	Tense body language Guarding affected area Restless Fidgeting Pacing	Body language 0. Relaxed 1. Tense, Distressed pacing, Fidgeting 2. Rigid. Fists clenched. Knees pulled up. Pulling or pushing away. Striking out	Activity/Body Movement Fidgeting, Pulling Away Flinching, Restless, Pacing, Refusing to move, Thrashing, Decreased activity, Moving slow, Impulsive behavior (Repetitive movements), Guarding sore area, Touching/ holding sore area, Limping, Clenched fist, Going into fetal position, Stiff/Rigid
Changes in Interpersonal Interactions Aggressive, combative, resisting care Decreased social interactions Socially inappropriate, disruptive Withdrawn			Language coherence and complexity (Pattern of social interaction) (Pattern of cooperation)		Social/Personality/Mood Physical aggression Not wanting to be touched Not allowing people near Angry/Mad, Throwing things
Changes in activity patterns or routines Refusing food, appetite change Increase in rest periods Sleep, rest pattern changes Sudden cessation of common routines, Increased wandering			(Eating pattern) (Sleep/wake pattern) (Pattern of wandering)		Changes in sleep Changes in appetite Trying to leave
Mental status changes Crying or tears Increased confusion Irritability or distress					Increased confusion

Comparison of Tool Items with Nonverbal Pain Indicators Identified in the AGS 2002 Persistent Pain Guidelines

AGS Guideline	CPAT Cervo, F. A et al. (2007).	DBS Stevenson, K. M. et al. (2006).	Dis DAT Regnard, C. et al. (2007).	EPCA 2 Morello, R. et al. (2007).
Facial expressions Slight frown; sad, frightened face Grimacing, wrinkled forehead, closed or tightened eyes Any distorted expression Rapid blinking	relaxed vs. scared or fearful	Grimacing, frowning, blinking. Tightly closed or widely open eyes. Frightened, weepy, worried, sad, pained.	Pick the words that best describe <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • facial appearance • jaw movement • appearance of the eyes 	0: Relaxed look on the face/ 1: Anxious look on the face 2: Patient grimaces from time to time 3: Frightened or tense 4: Totally rigid expression
Verbalizations, vocalizations Sighing, moaning, groaning Grunting, chanting, calling out Noisy breathing Asking for help Verbally abusive	calling out or moaning	Moaning, mumbling, chanting. Repetitive verbalizations grunting, whining, calling out, screaming, crying verbally aggressive or abusive noisy breathing	Pick the words that best describe <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • vocal sounds • speech 	Complaints voiced in the course of caregiving
Body movements Rigid, tense body posture, guarding Fidgeting Increased pacing, rocking Restricted movement Gait or mobility changes	Body language: is it tense or rigid? Activity level: moves easily vs. hand wringing	Tense, wringing hands, clenched fists, restless, rubbing/holding body part, hyper or hypoactive, guarding body part, repetitive physical movements.	Pick the words that best describe how this person sits and stands. Way of walking: Normal / Abnormal	Spontaneous posture adopted at rest Movements of the patient out of bed and/or in bed Reactions of the patient when painful parts of the body are nursed
Changes in Interpersonal Interactions Aggressive, combative, resisting care, Decreased social interactions Socially inappropriate, disruptive Withdrawn		Irritability, confusion. Reduced social interaction, agitation. Withdrawal from activities of interest. Aggressive or physically abusive. Decreased participation. Socially inappropriate/ disruptive. Exiting, elopement		Interaction of all kinds with other people Reactions during caregiver intervention
Changes in activity patterns or routines Refusing food, appetite change. Increase in rest periods. Sleep, rest pattern changes. Sudden cessation of common routines; increased wandering	normal behavior	Change in appetite wandering resists care Insomnia/change in usual sleep pattern	Body Observations Describe the pulse, breathing, sleep, appetite and usual eating pattern.	
Mental status changes Crying or tears. Increased confusion. Irritability or distress.	mood: pleasant vs. whiny	crying, tearfulness		Anxious anticipation of caregiver intervention

Comparison of Tool Items with Nonverbal Pain Indicators Identified in the AGS 2002 Persistent Pain Guidelines

AGS Guideline	MOBID Husebo, B. S. et al. (2007).	PAINE Cohen-Mansfield, J. (2006).	PBOICIE Tsai, P. F. et al. (2008).
Facial expressions Slight frown; sad, frightened face Grimacing, wrinkled forehead, closed or tightened eyes. Any distorted expression Rapid blinking	grimacing frowning tightening mouth closing eyes	showing tension in the face—frowning, tightening the eyes, squinting, clenching or grinding teeth (include if behaviors occur when you move them)	Clenching teeth
Verbalizations, vocalizations Sighing, moaning, groaning. Grunting, chanting, calling out. Noisy breathing Asking for help. Verbally abusive	ouch! groaning gasping screaming	Moaning, grunting, groaning Gasping, sighing Crying, whimpering, whining Screaming, yelling	
Body movements Rigid, tense body posture, guarding Fidgeting Increased pacing, rocking Restricted movement Gait or mobility changes	freezing guarding pushing crouching	Restlessness, repetitive movement. Rigidity, resistance to movement Guarding Bracing Posturing	Excessive stiffness of the affected joint during activities other than walking Shifting weight when seated Clutching or holding on to affected area Massaging affected area Rigid, tense body posture
Changes in Interpersonal Interactions Aggressive, combative, resisting care, Decreased social interactions Socially inappropriate, disruptive Withdrawn		How frequently was the resident involved in activities, such as listening to music, involvement in art projects, etc?	
Changes in activity patterns or routines Refusing food, appetite change. Increase in rest periods. Sleep, rest pattern changes. Sudden cessation of common routines; Increased wandering			
Mental status changes Crying or tears, increased confusion Irritability or distress		Moodiness, irritation, or depressed mood, seems sad, angry APATHETIC	

*In addition to the behavioral indicators listed,

The ABBEY includes two non-behavioral categories: Physiological change (eg temperature, pulse or blood pressure outside normal limits, perspiring, flushing or pallor.) and a category for etiological factors: Physical changes (eg. Skin tears, pressure areas, arthritis, contractures, previous injuries).

FLACC includes a category called “Consolability.”

PACSLAC includes physiological items (pale face, flushed, red face, teary eyed, sweating shaking/trembling, cold & clammy).

PADE includes an item for Global assessment of pain severity.

PAINAD includes an item called “Consolability.”

NOPPAIN includes a pain thermometer for global assessment of pain.

Dis DAT also documents appearance of the skin; base-line habits or mannerisms; special comforters, possessions or toys; how comfortable is this person with other people being physically near.

MOBID Assesses at rest and with specific movements of the trunk and extremities. Rate pain intensity for each behavior on scale from 0-10.

PAINE rates frequency of occurrence for each behavior. Additional assessment for physical signs includes: Falls , Trembling, shaking (not due to Parkinsonism or other similar condition),

Swollen joints: knuckles, knee, ankle, wrist,Tight or swollen belly, Blood stains on diaper or clothing of resident, Changes in vital signs (ie, B/P, pulse, temperature), Broken bones, dislocated limbs, such as shoulder or finger.